



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS
Washington, D.C. 20231
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/226,396	01/06/1999	ARON GAT	AGX-14	1125

7590 06/11/2002

TIMOTHY A CASSIDY
DORITY & MANNING
P O BOX 1449
GREENVILLE, SC 296021449

[REDACTED]
EXAMINER

NGUYEN, KIET TUAN

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
2881	14

DATE MAILED: 06/11/2002

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary

Application No.	09/226,396	Applicant(s)	GAT et al.
Examiner	K. NGUYEN	Group Art Unit	2881

—The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet beneath the correspondence address—

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, such period shall, by default, expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).

Status

- Responsive to communication(s) filed on 05-02-02
- This action is FINAL.
- Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11; 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- Claim(s) 32 - 73 is/are pending in the application.
- Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- Claim(s) 60 - 73 is/are allowed.
- Claim(s) 32 - 59 is/are rejected.
- Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction or election requirement.

Application Papers

- See the attached Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review, PTO-948.
- The proposed drawing correction, filed on 05-02-02 is approved disapproved.
- The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are objected to by the Examiner.
- The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119 (a)-(d)

- Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d).
- All Some* None of the CERTIFIED copies of the priority documents have been received.
- received in Application No. (Series Code/Serial Number) _____
- received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

*Certified copies not received: _____

Attachment(s)

- Information Disclosure Statement(s), PTO-1449, Paper No(s). _____
- Interview Summary, PTO-413
- Notice of Reference(s) Cited, PTO-892
- Notice of Informal Patent Application, PTO-152
- Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review, PTO-948
- Other _____

Office Action Summary

Rejection Under 35 U.S.C. 102

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless --

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Claims 32, 35, 39-42, 51 and 53-57 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being clearly anticipated by Moslehi et al. (5,446,825), Moslehi (5,635,409), or Moslehi et al. (5,367,606). (See the reasons as indicated in the previous office action dated November 20, 2001 in Paper No. 12).

Rejection Under 35 U.S.C. 103(a)

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

This application currently names joint inventors. In considering patentability of the claims under 35 U.S.C. 103(a), the examiner presumes that the subject matter of the various claims was commonly owned at the time any inventions covered therein were made absent any evidence to the contrary. Applicant is advised of the obligation under 37 CFR 1.56 to point out the inventor and invention dates of each claim that was not commonly owned at the time a later invention was

made in order for the examiner to consider the applicability of 35 U.S.C. 103© and potential 35 U.S.C. 102(f) or (g) prior art under 35 U.S.C. 103(a).

Claims 33-34, 36-38, 43-50, 52 and 58-59 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Moslehi et al. (5,367,606). (See the reasons as indicated in the previous office action dated November 20, 2001 in Paper No. 12).

Claims 60-73 are allowed.

Reasons for indicating allowable subject matter

The prior art fails to disclose an apparatus for heat treating semiconductor wafers, having a tuning device comprising a prismatic surface as recited in claim 60.

Applicant's arguments filed on May 02, 2002 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

Applicant argued that Moslehi et al. (5,446,825), Moslehi (5,635,409), or Moslehi et al. (5,367,606) does not disclose a tuning device that comprises a light energy source which is different from a first lamp device as recited in claim 51, and is spaced from at least one optical element comprising a light refracting device as recited in claim 32.

This argument is not persuasive. Since the applicant does not prove the different between the first and second lamp devices. Further, at least one of Moslehi et al. (5,446,825), Moslehi (5,635,409), and Moslehi et al. (5,367,606) disclose a plurality of lamps which are independently controlled by the computer, thereby the lamps are different; and are spaced from the quartz window 128 which is a light refracting optical device.

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Examiner *Kiet T. Nguyen* whose telephone number is **(703) 308-4855**.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application should be directed to the Group receptionist whose telephone number is **(703) 308-0956**.

Papers related to Art Unit 2881 applications **only** may be submitted to Art Unit 2881 by facsimile transmission. Any transmission not to be considered an official response must be clearly marked "**DRAFT**". The faxing of such papers must conform with the notice published in the Official Gazette, 1096 OG 30 (November 15, 1989). The Art Unit 2881 Fax Center number is **(703) 308-7723**.

K.T.N/Primary

June 8, 2002



KIET T. NGUYEN
PRIMARY EXAMINER